

**MINUTES OF SPECIAL MEETING
OF THE BOARD OF PARKS AND RECREATION
HELD IN THE ROBSON SQUARE MEDIA CENTRE
ON THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 26, 1996, AT 7:00 P.M.**

PRESENT:	Chair	David Chesman
	Vice Chair	Alan Featherstonhaugh
	Commissioners:	Allan DeGenova
		Tim Louis
		Donna Morgan
	General Manager	Vic Kondrosky
	Director, Administrative & Revenue Services	Philip Josephs
	Manager, Public Affairs	Terri Clark
Recording Secretary	Barbara Hammon	
ABSENT:	Commissioners	Duncan Wilson
		Malcolm Ashford

The Chair, Commissioner Chesman, opened the meeting at 7:05 p.m.

1. Presenter groups from the meeting of September 13, 1996 responded to the presentations made at that meeting.

Annelise Sorg, No Whales in Captivity - Urged Park Board to take immediate action to implement a comprehensive plan to retire whales to their natural habitat. Wants the two male whales being kept in holding tanks to be sent to Cape Breton rather than the amusement park the Aquarium is planning for them. Does not want to see whales exchanged. Insists mother and baby whale are to be kept together whatever happens.

Jim Harvey, Friends of Stanley Park - Wants the Aquarium to get in step with the times and stop their seige mentality. Monterey released their whale into the Bay successfully, Vancouver has a whole ocean at it's doorstep. Wants a whale-free city and aquarium. Urged Aquarium to develop outside interests for their cash flow, such as watching whales in the wild. Would like Aquarium to be included in the proposed harbour development. Believes Aquarium cannot afford new upgrade and should therefore, plan for outside trips to see sealife. Friends of Stanley Park will fight tooth and nail any further encroachment into the Park. Expects Park Board to set tough guidelines and let the Aquarium solve their own problems.

Vancouver Humane Society - Not present.

Peter Hamilton, Lifeforce - Here to tell the truth about the the whale and dolphin by-law. The by-law will not mean the mammals will be dumped into

the ocean and nor does it mean the Aquarium will have to close. The Aquarium is using scare tactics. There is lots of data that cetaceans suffer from captivity, for example Bioss's worn down teeth. Played video showing abusive capture of whales at Churchill. Wants to know why Aquarium binder was received just today.

Dr. Nightingale: Request for proposal binder only came in at 3:00 p.m.

Chairman: There was a mix-up regarding request. Not Aquarium's fault.

Dr. John Nightingale, Aquarium - Disappointed no plans put forward from last meeting. Dr. Watts' five options for dealing with whales is a clear division of the alternatives. They are common sense. However, euthanasia is not an option. Retiring or moving the whales, why? when Vancouver Aquarium is at the top end for looking after whales. Release is not an option. Inertia, letting them phase out of the Aquarium could result in a lonely whale, like the polar bear.

The option we are proposing is "what can be done to make care for the animals better". We have said no whales will be taken or caused to be taken from the wild. Aquarium needs to work better with the Park Board and the community.

2. BOARD TO DIRECT QUESTIONS TO CONCERNED GROUPS

Commissioner Fetherstonhaugh: Whales that are born in captivity, what are the possibilities of introducing them into the wild?

John Quarter: Chances for captive born whales are worse than animals taken from the wild. Only experience we can draw on is an aquarium in Australia. There were two and every effort was made to train them and that resulted in failure. I say it is not possible. Individuals can be brought in for temporary reasons, but for captive born animals it is a long shot.

Dr. Bain: This is a goal the Aquarium shares with the animals rights groups. At this point we don't know how to do that and we aren't very good at returning wild born animals. Success ratio is about 10-15%. We need to identify animals that are the most likely to survive, release them, and use that for our research. We can't rush the process. In the wild there is more to eating fish that are put in front of you. They need to know where their food supply is and knowing what not to eat, for example, plastic. They need to know who their predators are. White Wings thinks that Killer Whales are his friends when in fact whales eat dolphins.

Commissioner Fetherstonhaugh: I agree that it is going to be more difficult to reintroduce. Foraging behavior is something not much is known about. The fact that it is difficult and a long shot doesn't mean it is impossible. A great deal of research has to be done if you want to change initial reaction from cautious encouragement to a trend of more intensive research.

Commissioner Tim Louis: Dr. Watts what would you do in my shoes?

Dr. Watts: Our job is to do the right thing. I would advocate the retirement

option. Rehabilitation would be a long shot.

Commissioner Tim Louis: If there was agreement on both sides involving you in bringing about the retirement option would you be available to do that?

Dr. Watts: Depends on what I am doing. In the ideal situation it would be great.

Commissioner Tim Louis: To what degree would the Aquarium work along with Dr. Watts' scenario for retirement.

Dr. Nightingale: No one has mentioned the incredible cost. Are you suggesting that Vancouver taxpayers would pay? We are very interested in reintroducing cetaceans. The research needs to go ahead but has been stymied for money. If you speak to researchers they would suggest you use a different animal as a model. To send them to Cape Breton when that is a place that still kills a great number of whales....we can't take them away from people and children who love them. We are not particularly interested.

Commissioner Tim Louis: I am looking for an answer. Would the Aquarium be opposed to at least exploring the retirement option as outlined if it did not cost the Vancouver Aquarium money?

Dr. Nightingale: Yes we are against starting out on a pilot program. It depends on the circumstances of wild populations.

Dr. Watts: You have to remember a bunch of little old ladies and children raised \$13,000,000 to free Willy. The retirement option would be significantly less.

Dr. Nightingale: \$10,000,000 for Keiko came from 3 sources, Time Warner, Makos and an anonymous source. Only \$2,000,000 came from small donations.

Annelise Sorg: What we are proposing is the two whales and the older females, so it would not take away from the Aquarium's income.

Commissioner Tim Louis: I am looking for compromise. These animals are not on public display.

Dr. Nightingale: Not all animals live on display all the time. It isn't a static thing so that some animals are surplus.

John Ford: Problem with retirement option is these animals are in the Aquarium under our care. To lose our ability where we can't care for them is irresponsible. We would lose our ability to trade animals when they become sick. Another problem is nets.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: Dr. Watts can you tell me how we can enrich their environment and relieve boredom at the Aquarium?

Dr. Watts: People have spent lots of money building bigger and better

aquariums and that is not what I mean. Personal control. Presenting them with behavior challenges. The Aquarium trainer interaction is nothing to sneeze at. I believe that every trainer cares but it is still a hostage-keeper situation. These animals need more control, for example, choosing their own food.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: Would the size of the pool help?

Dr. Watts: The larger the tank the better the situation would be. Friends of Stanley Park would no doubt object.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: Regarding the Belugas, you indicated they should be sent off.

Dr. Watts: There are two Belugas waiting now for incompatible problems. I don't think they can be kept in isolation for the rest of their lives.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: Whales that would be bred with human care, would these whales be loaned to aquariums being built now? Would you put them on loan?

Dr. Nightingale: Depends on where they came from. Vancouver Aquarium is the only non-profit one. So many new aquariums do not have our ethics. They see whales in terms of harvesting. I think you will see breeding loans.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: If for some reason these whales all died or if there was an earthquake would you rebuild with whales?

Dr. Nightingale: To be a complete educational institution you need some cetaceans.

Commissioner Allan DeGenova: Is it your intention to have only two Orcas or will there be three?

Dr. Nightingale: There could be a birth. We just don't know. We never say never.

Commissioner Donna Morgan: I am interested in the idea of the Killer and Beluga Whales and whether or not there is a number of whales for a successful breeding population so there will be no more whales captured.

Dr. Bain: For the next 145 years you could breed from the existing pool without in-breeding.

Commissioner Morgan: How many killer Whales are there?

Dr. Bain: 49-50.

Commissioner Morgan: Would you be cross-breeding Atlantic whales with Pacific whales?

Dr. Bain: Yes.

Commissioner Morgan: The position of the Aquarium is that you "would not capture or cause to be captured from the wild", seems to me you are softening your stand?

Dr. Nightingale: Exactly the opposite. We have placed a moratorium effective September 16th, 1996. No whale captured after this date will ever be at the Vancouver Aquarium.

Commissioner Chesman: My understanding is that is a change of position. That the Aquarium will not cause to be captured, you are now saying you are prepared to be legally bound to that?

Dr. Nightingale: All Cetaceans.

Commissioner Chesman: The Aquarium does understand that the Park Board is specifically interested in reconstructing a poisoned relationship with the Aquarium?

Dr. Nightingale: Feeling on the Aquarium' s side is likewise. The Aquarium is in Stanley Park and it is going to stay there. We both deal with the same issues. We desperately need to work together through communication and planning.

Commissioner Chesman: Annelise you have asked for the destruction of the Aquarium.

Annelise Sorg: We have a straight forward mandate. We do not accept that whales and dolphins live in captivity. We don' t have a mandate to close the Aquarium.

Peter Hamilton: We have spent time and money to find other options for the Aquarium to raise money without whales.

Commissioner Chesman: What about a scuba pool in the Park?

Jim Harvey: Friends of Stanley Park only look at the future. Your job is to look at today. The Park is going to change. Traffic is going to stop. Scuba is recreational activity and anything that is recreational is positive. The inner harbour is a great idea.

Commissioner Chesman: Dr. Watt what would you do in the public' s interest?

Dr. Watts: I am not talking about the Aquarium' s financial interests. In terms of public education and input I think the retirement option is the best. You could learn the most in a natural environment.

Commissioner Chesman: I am elected to serve Vancouver. The retirement option wouldn' t serve Vancouver' s interest.

Dr. Watts: Nebulous benefits could be gained.

Commissioner Chesman: You view the Aquarium as a positive educational institution?

Dr. Watts: That is one of the strategies it uses to validate it's position, it's good.

Commissioner Chesman: Wouldn't it be better to put a rescued animal in Bras D' or Lake?

Dr. Watts: It comes down to whether you feel you have a personal responsibility for it's welfare. If you leave it in the wild that's the end of our moral obligation. Society would think there is a difference in retiring a captive animal because we have interfered.

Commissioner Featherstonhaugh: I have a concern about what safeguards you have about exchanging. What would the Aquarium do to assure that they wouldn't be used or abused?

Dr. Nightingale: There are no guarantees, but that is something that everybody discusses where animals are concerned. These animals are so important that the standard of care has risen dramatically.

Commissioner Louis: Now that you have made a commitment to not capture, would you also agree that you would not get a whale from an aquarium that intends to capture a replacement whale?

Dr. Nightingale: The best we can do is ask. But in terms of doing that legally it is impossible.

Commissioner Louis: They can if they have a binding contract. Would you require that aquarium to enter into a binding contract with the Vancouver Aquarium?

Dr. Nightingale: As things stand, the Vancouver Aquarium is the only aquarium that has agreed not to capture any more whales. No one is willing to be bound by our point of view. We can ask but if it is an absolute prohibition then we have lost our ability to manage our whales. If we can't exchange when we need to, then the decision to provide the best care is taken away from us.

Commissioner Chesman: How much impact would having no whales have on your educational program?

Dr. Nightingale: Total. What do you think we do if it isn't educational? What happens to people is based on the living animal. In terms of education they are at the top for visitors. They are the keystone.

Commissioner Morgan: At the meeting of July 31, we said that in the long term we would look towards phasing out, and you are telling me tonight that it is not the length of that road, since you are not going down that road at all.

Dr. Nightingale: We can see the start of the road, but we can't see around the bend.

Commissioner Morgan: You are not willing to see phasing out as a long term goal!

Dr. Nightingale: No. I am not willing to put that restriction in the future.

Commissioner Morgan: I have your poll that there is no right side. It is 50-50 to keep whales. At what point will the Aquarium begin moving towards the more modern institution?

Dr. Nightingale: When it is no longer a benefit to educate children. The reality is these other institutions have had massive infusions of money.

Commissioner Morgan: I don' t think we can have a compromise if the Aquarium is unwilling to go down that road.

Dr. Nightingale: As far as I can see I can' t go down that road. I don' t see the end of having them for educational purposes. What do you put in that is equally educational and how do you pay for it? I can' t see down that road.

Commissioner Chesman: The Aquarium won' t cause the capture of wild whales. I think that is a huge step forward. But they need to exchange whales. Here is my problem. Dr. Watts said if you have to be a captive whale, it is best to be in Vancouver because it is the best. What is wrong with that?

Annelise Sorg: If a Killer Whale is in a 100' pool or a 1,000' pool I don' t think there is any difference. Paul Watson is saying that the Vancouver Aquarium is a wonderful place because he is being funded by the whale industry.

Commissioner Chesman: You are saying you can' t see past the next bend in the road. I believe I know what you are saying. When we ask questions of the Aquarium we are told it is none of our business, but you are on public land. Are you prepared to investigate alternatives such as multi-media and further research in the science of release?

Dr. Nightingale: Yes. We are reaching out and doing things that the business person suggested. We wholesale, manufacture, web site. Yes for rehabilitation. We are co-sponsoring the conference in 2001. Scientists need to get together to exchange information.

3. PUBLIC DELEGATIONS

Tyler Riley, 12 year old boy - Aquarium has aided him in making his decision to become a biologist, especially because of his interaction with the whales. Says only rich people can afford to see whales in the wild.

Lee Newby, working biologist working with captive whales - Became interested in biology as a career in 1974 when he saw the whales. Believes blue wave in agriculture is the future.

Greg Roth, educator for Vancouver Aquarium, hosts sleepovers - knows the educational benefits of seeing whales first hand.

Lorraine Irving, resident of Vancouver - Supports Aquarium. Tired of having her wishes misrepresented by a vocal minority. Whales should be left to live out their lives in peace and security. Serves no purpose to release whales

simply as an experiment.

Commissioner Morgan: You don' t sound very silent to me. Would you support a public referendum to see what the public wants.

Lorraine Irving: Yes, I am leaning towards that.

Raymond Nakamura, Aquarium staff, developing the Aqua Van. Would not place educational value above what is best for the whales. Staying in the Aquarium is best for the whales.

Margaret Butschler, has been around since before the days of the Aquarium. From the Aquarium her sons and grandchildren have learned to respect and value animals and their habitat.

Ben White, represents Friends of Animals - Wants to know why is the Aquarium going to ban the capture of whales. If it is wrong to capture whales, it is not a question of when they should stop but whether they should have ever in the first place. Suggests the message that should be sent to every child is "deprivation is ok as long as it is entertaining".

Bob Chorush, Progressive Wildlife Society, Washington state - The Orca breeding program at the Aquarium doesn' t exist all the Orcas die at the Vancouver Aquarium. For over ten years they have had one dolphin kept in isolation. Why doesn' t he get a friend? Close the Aquarium and turn it into a scientific rehabilitation centre.

Tony Pletcher - Aquarium is world class. The majority of visitors do not live in Vancouver so who gives this Park Board the right to speak for all these people.

Richard Gregory, Board of Govenors at the Vancouver Aquarium - Children have been disenfranchised from this meeting and the Parks Board election and plebiscite. What would the result be if the children were included?

Stephen Samuel, school board candidate - Won' t save his conscience if the whales are released and they die.

Imtiuz Poput, Green Party Candidate - Believes the Aquarium' s plan is for the sheer enjoyment of the public. Reminds him of the days of slavery when they said they wouldn' t capture any more, just breed what they had.

Cody Fletcher & Sister, Keep whales until their life span is over. If whales are released keep a tracer on them.

Shelley McDonald - From visits to the Aquarium daughter knows whales and has resulted in her making informed decisions about wild life. Because of the whales at the Aquarium people' s attitude about whales has changed from reviled to revered.

Christopher Moreno, Applied ethics consultant - All of the solutions require technology for a moral problem. Suggests constructive dialogue about moral

process. Would like children to see whales because technology wouldn't teach them as much.

Joanna Reitenbach - Handful of architects want to see out of sight out of the way. Urged Board to read letters from children who want whales to stay.

Del Press, Staff member of the Aquarium - Wants the Friends of Stanley Park to understand that if they keep suggesting moving everything out to the harbour that environment will be polluted too.

Jeremy Haywood, Employee of Vancouver Aquarium - Opposes by-law. There are many species that benefit from the studies at the Aquarium.

Wendy Pope - Both sides have common goals to raise world wide understanding of conservation to help all whales. Need to let each other go about their goals in their own separate ways. It is best for the whales.

Daphne Damborg, Aquarium Education Program - Takes children through Aquarium to learn about sea life. Wants Aquarium to remain as is.

Rick Goring, Because we don't know what we are doing right now, let's do the best job we can. If that means exchanging we should do that. If something better comes along in the future we can do that.

Sarah Russell, Employee of the Aquarium - Believes education Aquarium gives is important.

Sarah Newton, Staff member - Read letter of support. Believes whales can't be seen properly at sea.

Donna Templeton, Volunteer at Aquarium - Believes Aquarium is an invaluable educational tool for family and friends.

Andrea Park - Read letter from Dr. Lewis who works in animal center in Abbotsford and Vancouver Aquarium. Believes the Vancouver Aquarium gets very little public recognition which they deserve.

Brendan Anderson, Naturalist at Vancouver Aquarium - Works on the floor with visitors to the Aquarium and watches their reactions. People are learning.

Clint Wright, Curator at Vancouver Aquarium - Believes animals need to be at the Aquarium so they can be studied. The animals are very well cared for.

Michael Rand, Resident and voter in Vancouver - Supports Aquarium and staff, knows they have the well-being of the creatures in their hearts.

Sheila Nixon, speaking on behalf of Susan Welch. Supports Aquarium and brings her students to Aquarium. It is an economical way to see whales.

Jamie Thompson, Employee of Del Press - Visitors from all over the world want to see Aquarium. Read letter of support from Betsy Bennett a governor of

the Vancouver Aquarium who doesn't believe the Aquarium should be dictated to by politicians.

Anne Young, Marine mammal specialist at the Aquarium - Read letter of support from John Fisher whose son saw the whale 20 years ago and is now a PhD in whale research. Seeing the whales at the Aquarium had a profound effect on his son.

Kim Ballantyne, Staff member of the Vancouver Aquarium - Read letter of support from Mrs. G Charlesworth. Moved to Vancouver from England seven years ago and loves visiting the whales. Wants bigger habitat built.

Sheila Hill, Marine Biologist at Vancouver Aquarium - Read letter from a mother who believes visits to the Aquarium gave her daughter goals and direction in life.

Michelle Brown, Animal care in Vancouver Aquarium, birds and reptiles - Believes people who know what is best don't often get asked their opinion. People who don't get close often have the most opinions. We know what is best - keep the Aquarium and the whales.

Nicole Stewart, Naturalist at the Vancouver Aquarium - Feels pride for where she works. Read letter of support from woman who wants whales to remain in the Aquarium.

Skip Young, Employee of Vancouver Aquarium - Works with animals and veterinarians every day and opposes by-law. Read letter of support from veterinarian Dr. James Anthony who states that a vocal few are willing to eliminate this valuable resource.

Lionel Hannestad - Resents idea of sending whales to Nova Scotia to become a tourist attraction. Believes it is shortsighted.

Leslie Smith - Doesn't believe the Park Board has the right to remove whales. Just a small vocal few who want the whales out of the Park. Thinks the 18 million people who have visited should be asked their opinion.

Commissioner Chesman: "Just a small group", that comment is unfair. I don't say that it is a small group. The polls show, including the Aquarium's that there is a significant concern over whales in captivity. We can't ignore the issue as a public board. There used to be a time when we celebrated one woman or man who changed society, so I am not interested in how many people, I am interested in ideas.

Carey Fouks - Chastized the two Board members who were absent. Said the Board was not elected to kick the Aquarium out of the Park or stop having whales.

Commissioner Louis: The motion that brought us here was apolitical and across all party lines. How would you feel about a referendum?

Carey Fouks: You aren' t marine biologists and you shouldn' t be doing this.

Commissioner Morgan: I am a marine biologist.

Carey Fouks: You still weren' t hired to do this.

John Rawle, Employee of Vancouver Aquarium - Read letter from woman in Oklahoma who visited whales and bonded with them.

Dr. Trites, Director of Marine Mammal Research UBC - Stressed the importance of studying animals in captivity.

Howard Phipps spoke on behalf of Paul Clarke, Board of Govenors Vancouver Aquarium - Stated that the whales in the wild are helped by the research done at Aquarium.

Herb Lipsman, Voter - Wants aquarium expanded and include food services.

Casmir Lindsey - Questioned whether it is necessary to impose restrictions on Aquarium. Controversy has forced Aquarium to make a good decision not to capture any more whales. Now Aquarium will be under public scrutiny. Wants support for the Aquarium and let them come up with the best plan.

Paul Watson, Sea Shepherd Conservation Party - Discussed how whales and dolphins are legally killed every year. If the Aquarium is restricted by by-law there will be no way to rehabilitate marine animals. By-law ties Aquarium' s hands. The Aquarium has a record of helping marine animals. I am not biased because I am funded by the whale industry. That is not true. I am a volunteer I don' t get paid. What we need is more people involved in the real ocean with the real animals.

Meliza Queiroz, former teacher/psychologist - Lives on the edge of Stanley Park and loves the Aquarium. Believes many young people because of their experience at Aquarium care about conservation and whales.

Joseph Connors, Faculty of Medicine UBC & son works at Aquarium - By-law hurts whales because it decreases Aquarium' s ability to care for whales. Hurts Vancouver too because every advertisement of Vancouver includes whales.

Commissioner Chesman: The by-law was written as a focal point for discussion. It is important to read the public' s mood, that they are concerned about taking whales out of the wild. Do you agree?

Joseph Connors: That is one of the things you have accomplished. You have made the Aquarium examine their stand.

Commissioner Chesman: This process has been to find some common ground that doesn' t destroy the Aquarium but revamp an unfortunate relationship that has developed over 40 years.

Michelle Patterson, Youth Volunteer at Aquarium - Volunteering at Aquarium

taught her valuable personal coping skills while being deeply depressed. Being with whales soothed her and made her better.

Mary Bennett, 70 years old - Father was gardener in Stanley Park. The whole family has always loved the whales. Concerned about the future of the Aquarium.

Mervyn Gilbert-Smith - Friend has 10 year old with Cerebral Palsy. Helped him to be around the whales.

Joe Bauer, Fisherman - Whales survival may depend on what is learned at Aquarium. Need to understand the biology of the whales and what impact humans have on their environment.

Elizabeth Braun, Scuba Diver - No multi-media sources can replace real experience. In Africa vehicles are destroying wild habitats this could happen with whale watching. Doesn' t support bylaw.

Al Guilbault - Proposal to put whales in Bras D' or Lake could cause real incest problems. How would they be sterilized? Tourist boats would be very stressful for them.

Eleanor Hadley - Wants to free the whales. Believes whale meeting is orchestrated by Dr. Nightingale. Aquarium should spend time cleaning up the ocean.

Jane Van Roggen - Questions is it bad to keep the whales? Nothing she had heard so far indicates it is.

Digna David, Biologist - Enjoys learning first hand from attending Aquarium.

Bruce Howe, Board of Govenors of Aquarium - It it ain' t broke don' t fix it. Th Board of Govenors is working hard to improve Aquarium. Forget referendum and support Aquarium.

Commissioner Chesman: The real issue is the relationship between the Park Board and the Aquarium. I don' t say it is broke.

Kaya Sodowski - Doesn' t want whales released because they won' t survive. Wants to learn more about them so we can protect their delicate future.

Dr. David Moore, Board of Govenors Vancouver Aquarium - By-law will interfere with the Aquarium' s ability to run autonomously.

Brian Sheehan, Marine mammal specialst. Read letter from visitor who is against keeping whales, but said it was the best place to be if you were a captive whale.

Dennis Christen, Marine mammal care specialist at Vancouver Aquarium - Has hands-on experience with the whales. Wild animals benefit from what they learn at Aquarium.

Female - Blew whale whistle and discussed whales in their pods and how important families are to whales.

Todd - Became a biologist as a result of his visits to the Aquarium when he was younger.

Angela Hogan, No Whales in Captivity - Urged Dr. Nightingale to be responsible for all whales, not just those in captivity.

Liz Gerzky - Involved in the Sleep-over program and believes it sparks children to care about whales.

Flo Fitzgerald - Volunteer at Aquarium for 30 years. People learn from books when they come face-to-face with the whales everything they have learned becomes real.

Steve Hastings - If these discussions lead to a better relationship, time is well spent. The object of some people here is the removal of the whales. The Aquarium has agreed not to capture more whales, but they must be free to exchange whales.

Commissioner Chesman: What I want to do is re-invent the relationship with the Aquarium. The issue has been misconstrued. Whales are an emotional issue and the media has caught onto that. The focus remains the relationship after 40 years of neglect.

Carol Paquette, Volunteer - Believes proposed by-law interferes with quality of care Aquarium will be able to offer.

Male, Father of two children. Full support behind the Aquarium which educates and helps preserve habitats.

Male - Opposed to Parks Board by-law to enforce ethics. The ethics that animals have rights. If that is the case then all the livestock, horses and cows, should be set free. When you pass by-law you have to take into consideration costs. Using Board' s power to interfere with an independent institution is unfair. Park Board has no right to go into a private organization.

Linda Sullivan, Marine biologist and teacher. Has worked at Aquarium for 20 years and whales are not unhappy.

Rick Walk - Many industries are being dragged kicking and screaming into the 21st century--tobacco, auto, Aquarium. Listen. Pass the by-law.

Anita Romaniuk, Candidate for Park Board - Urged by-law be passed. There are creative solutions. Use the referendum.

Sheila Connors - Won' t be able to have a say in a referendum because she lives in Surrey. Elderly mother with Alzheimer disease is soothed being near the whales.

Chris Josky - 3 year old daughter loves whales, they bring her joy and wonder. By-law will affect people like her. Whale watching is too expensive, unsafe and bad news for the whales.

Nora Francis, Member of Aquarium - Objects to Dr. Nightingale saying that anyone who is not supportive of the Aquarium is an animal activist. No longer in favor of captivity. Wants to know why there is secrecy and evasiveness about many issues at the Aquarium.

Male - Being opposed to captivity doesn' t mean we are opposed to the Aquarium. Aquarium needs to embrace change and understand that children can love whales without having them in captivity.

Lee Johnson (Letter) - Currently living in third world country. Believes investing millions to keep whales is ridiculous and not natural. Need to respect all living animals. Do not support those who abuse animals. Pass by-law.

Bette Welsh, Volunteer and admitted old Hippy - Ecologically literate. Need to work with Aquarium to protect animals and habitats. Reject by-law.

Anglea Carter - Her children do not need to go eye-ball to eye-ball to appreciate whales.

Female - Gave book to Parks Board by Peter Knudson called Orca Visions of a Killer Whale. Her child went to the Aquarium and realized the terrible truth about the captive whale program.

Female - Scientists are just learning about whales. Research is essential in order to amplify animals in the wild. Against by-law.

Dave Ferendez, Coordinator of Youth Volunteers - Read letter of support from Wendy Masus. Uses Aquarium as education tool for children to the wonder of sealife. Youth is tomorrow' s leaders in conservation. Don' t remove this opportunity from them.

Male - "How does passing this by-law enhance relationship"?

Commissioner Chesman: The connection is the animal activists who have their own agenda, get in front of us. We have listened with open minds and we get the public showing up and they are usually expressing their concerns with whales in captivity. The whale issue is only one of them. It is a poisoned relationship. For example, the Aquarium asks if they can sell coffee during the Jazz Festival and we say ok. Then months later we are informed they are still selling coffee. When we ask them they say something like of yeah we were going to ask for a longer time but didn' t think we would get it so we didn' t ask. It is disturbing to me the Aquarium has not communicated this to their members.

Male - What has selling coffee got to do with whales?

Commissioner Chesman: The main focus is the poisoned relationship.

Moved by Commissioner Chesman,

- THAT the Aquarium be invited to enter in a Park Board /Aquarium accord to be negotiated with the Aquarium and recorded in a Memorandum of Understanding. Memo of Understanding will be secured by an Aquarium lease renewal and/or amendment to the Park Board By Law incorporating the following terms and conditions:

1. That there be a prohibition against the Aquarium capturing or causing to be captured cetaceans for importation to the Vancouver Park system. That such prohibition have the following two strictly limited exceptions:
 - a. Importation of cetaceans from the wild for the purposes of rehabilitation, where rehabilitation is deemed necessary by a named neutral third party to be identified OR
 - b. For the purpose of preserving an endangered cetacean species as named by a neutral third party.
2. That there be a mechanism to guard against a domino effect.
3. That the Memo of Understanding would speak to the Aquarium' s commitment to investigate, and where viable, implement multi-media educational programs in addition to, and complementary to, live whale exhibits.
4. Increased research and participation in release and rehabilitation science.

The accord shall also record a joint Park Board/Aquarium commitment to greater Vancouver public service through Aquarium outreach through community centers specifically youth and other joint initiatives as might be appropriate.

Moved by Commissioner Morgan,

- That the issue before us be put forward in the November election.